

Name _____ Date _____

Chart of Various Plans (Blank)



<http://edsitement.neh.gov>

Plan	Federation or National Government	# of Branches	Judiciary	Executive	Legislative	Other
Virginia						
New Jersey						
Hamilton						
Connecticut/ Great Compromise						



Chart of Various Plans

Plan	Federation or National Government	# of Branches	Judiciary	Executive	Legislative	Other
Virginia	National	3	Chosen by national legislature.	Chosen by national legislature.	Lower house chosen by popular election "proportioned to the Quotas of contribution, or to the number of free inhabitants." Upper house chosen by lower house. Also proportional.	National legislature has veto power over states.
New Jersey	Federation	3	Appointed by executive. Confirmed by Senate.	Elected by acts of Congress.	One house with equal representation. "Supreme law of the states."	"Executive and a convenient number of the National Judiciary ought to compose a Council of revision with authority to examine every act of the National Legislature before it shall operate . . . requisitions in proportion to the whole number of white and other free citizens and inhabitants of every age, sex and condition, including those bound to servitude for a term of years, and three-fifths of all other persons not comprehended in the foregoing description, except Indians not paying taxes."
Hamilton	National	3	Can serve for life.	Can serve for life. Chosen by electors from the states. "To have a negative on all laws about to be passed."	Senators can serve for life. "Assembly" members elected for three years. Can pass "all laws whatsoever."	
Connecticut/ Great Compromise	National	3	Appointed by executive. Confirmed by Senate.	Single executive. Chosen by Electoral College.	Two houses. Representation in lower house based on population (3/5 of slaves). Upper house, two representatives per state.	Included a national supremacy clause.



Four Fathers' Quotes

Ellsworth:

The largest States are the worst Governed. Virga. is obliged to acknowledge her incapacity to extend her Govt. to Kentucky. Masts. cannot keep the peace one hundred miles from her capitol and is now forming an army for its support. How long Pena. may be free from a like situation cannot be foreseen. If the principles and materials of our Govt. are not adequate to the extent of these single States; how can it be imagined that they can support a single Govt. throughout the U. States?

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/625.htm>

... strike out "to be paid out of the natil. Treasury" and insert "to be paid by their respective States." If the Senate was meant to strengthen the Govt., it ought to have the confidence of the States. The States will have an interest in keeping up a representation, and will make such provision for supporting the members as will ensure their attendance.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/626.htm>

The power of self-defence was essential to the small States. Nature had given it to the smallest insect of the creation. He could never admit that there was no danger of combinations among the large States. They will like individuals find out and avail themselves of the advantage to be gained by it.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/629.htm>

... remarks were not the result of partial or local views. The State he represented held a middle rank.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/630.htm>

... and that the rule of contribution by direct taxation for the support of the Government of the U. States shall be the number of white inhabitants, and three-fifths of every other description in the several States, until some other rule that shall more accurately ascertain the wealth of the several States can be devised and adopted by the Legislature.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/712.htm>

Paterson:

... there was no more reason that a great individual State contributing much should have more votes than a small one contributing little than that a rich individual citizen should have more votes than an indigent one.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/609.htm>

... the Articles of Confederation ought to be so revised, corrected and enlarged as to render the federal Constitution adequate to the exigencies of Government and the preservation of the Union.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/615.htm>

If a proportional representation be right, why do we not vote so here?

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/616.htm>

But perhaps the Inequality of the present system is not so obvious — the States being equal, have equal votes — so in the respective States, individuals have equal votes tho' they possess unequal Property.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/const/king.htm#june18>

Men with 4000 pounds and those with 100 pounds have equal votes, tho' one possesses 40 times the Property of the other.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/const/king.htm#june18>

... the small States would never be able to defend themselves without an equality of votes in the 2d. branch. There was no other ground of accomodation. His resolution was fixt. He would meet the large States on that Ground and no other.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/707.htm>

He could regard Negroes slaves in no light but as property. They are no free agents, have no personal liberty, no faculty of acquiring property, but on the contrary are themselves property and, like other property, entirely at the will of the Master. Has a man in Virgia. a number of votes in proportion to the number of his slaves?

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/709.htm>

He proposed that the Executive should be appointed by Electors to be chosen by the States in a ratio that would allow one elector to the smallest and three to the largest States.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/719.htm>

Randolph:

(I) regret that it should fall to (me), rather than those who were of longer standing in life and political experience, to open the great subject of their mission.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/529.htm>

... In revising the federal system, we ought to inquire 1. into the properties, which such a government ought to possess, 2. the defects of the confederation, 3. the danger of our situation and 4. the remedy.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/529.htm>

... the imbecility of the existing Confederacy and the danger of delaying a substantial reform.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/616.htm>

If the States were to pay the members of the Natl. Legislature, a dependence would be created that would vitiate the whole System. The whole nation has an interest in the attendance and services of the members. The Nationl. Treasury, therefore, is the proper fund for supporting them.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/622.htm>

... strenuous agst. making the National Council dependent on the Legislative rewards of the States. Those who pay are the masters of those who are paid. Payment by the States would be unequal as the distant States would have to pay for the same term of attendance and more days in travelling to and from the seat of the Govt.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/622.htm>

He urged strenuously that express security ought to be provided for including slaves in the ratio of Representation. He lamented that such a species of property existed. But as it did exist, the holders of it would require this security. It was perceived that the design was entertained by some of excluding slaves altogether; the Legislature therefore ought not to be left at liberty.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/712.htm>

... urged the motion of Mr. L. Martin for restoring the words making the Executive ineligible a 2d. time. If he ought to be independent, he should not be left under a temptation to court a re-appointment.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/719.htm>

... the general object was to provide a cure for the evils under which the United States labored; that, in tracing these evils to their origin, every man had found it in the turbulence and follies of democracy; that some check therefore was to be sought for against this tendency of our governments; and that a good Senate seemed most likely to answer the purpose.

Source: <http://memory.loc.gov>, searching on "The Debates in the Several State Conventions on the Adoption of the Federal Constitution (Elliot's Debates), Thursday, May 31. Page 138"

Hamilton:

Two Sovereignties cannot co-exist within the same limits. Giving powers to Congress must eventuate in a bad Govt. or in no Govt.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/618.htm>

The States have constantly shown a disposition rather to regain the powers delegated by them than to part with more, or to give effect to what they had parted with.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/618.htm>

If States are to deliberate on the mode, they will also deliberate on the object of the supplies, and will grant or not grant as they approve.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/618.htm>

The more close the Union of the States, and the more compleat the authority of the whole: the less opportunity will be allowed the stronger States to injure the weaker.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/619.htm>

... alter it so as to run "that the Government of the United States ought to consist of a supreme legislative, Executive and Judiciary." This alteration he said would drop the word national, and retain the proper title "the United States."

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/620.htm>



No Government could give us tranquility and happiness at home, which did not possess sufficient stability and strength to make us respectable abroad.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/629.htm>

... urged the necessity of 3 years. There ought to be neither too much nor too little dependence, on the popular sentiments. The checks in the other branches of Govern. would be but feeble, and would need every auxiliary principle that could be interwoven. The British House of Commons were elected septennially, yet the democratic spirit of ye. Constitution had not ceased.

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/621.htm>

Of late the Govern. had entirely given way to the people, and had in fact suspended many of its ordinary functions in order to prevent those turbulent scenes which had appeared elsewhere. He asks Mr. S. whether the State at this time, dare impose and collect a tax on ye. people?

Source: <http://www.yale.edu/lawweb/avalon/debates/626.htm>